

Report of the Director of City Strategy

A19/A1237 Roundabout Improvements – Consultation Results and Detailed Design

Summary

1. This report provides the results of the consultation undertaken on the proposed improvements to the A19/A1237 roundabout. It also updates the Executive Member on the changes which have been made to address the comments and accommodate constraints identified during the design period. The report identifies that, subject to approval, the amended scheme can be constructed within a revised budget allocation in the summer/autumn of this year.

Recommendations

2. The Executive Member is recommended to:
 - Note the comments raised by the public, Councillors and interested organisations.
 - Note the Officer's response to the comments and the proposed amendments to the design.
 - Approve the further development of the scheme in line with the amended layout to enable the improvements to be tendered and constructed in the summer/autumn of 2010.
 - Approve the inclusion of a total allocation of £1.5m in the City Strategy Capital Programme to construct the proposed scheme.
 - Authorise the removal of the minimum amount of vegetation from the A1237 West landscaped bund in February, to allow the main works to proceed later in the year to minimise the impact on nesting birds.

Reason: To reduce journey times for travellers in the A19/A1237 area whilst maintaining safe crossing points for pedestrians and cyclists.

Background

Overview

3. The 2008 Outer Ring Road study confirmed that travellers on the A19 to A59 section of the A1237 Outer Ring Road experience some of the worst journey delays on the entire route. The upgrade of the A59 roundabout is included in the Access York Phase 1 scheme planned for delivery in 2011/12 subject to DfT funding approval. The works proposed in this report will reduce journey times in the A19 area.
4. The Executive Member approved the delivery of improvements to the A19/A1237 roundabout using the additional funding from the Regional Funding Allocation at the 21 July 2009 City Strategy Decision Session.
5. The outline layout of the improvements was approved at the 20 October City Strategy Decision Session to enable the scheme to be put out for consultation.

Consultation

6. Following further preparatory work after the confirmation of the preferred option a consultation exercise was undertaken between 27 November and 18 December to ensure the views of the adjacent population, external stakeholders and users of the roundabout were identified to allow incorporation into the final design where possible. The consultation leaflet and layout drawings are included in Annex 1 and 2.
7. The consultation included the following elements:
 - Distribution of a leaflet to all households in the Skelton, Clifton Without and Rawcliffe Ward area. (approx. 6,000)
 - Displays at Clifton Library, 9 St. Leonard's Place and Rawcliffe Bar Park & Ride site.
 - A staffed exhibition at the Rawcliffe Bar Park & Ride site on 10 December (9:00 to 20:00)
 - Attendance at the Rawcliffe Parish Council Meeting on 14 December
 - Erection of road signs on the approaches to the roundabout.
 - City of York Council Website
 - Creation of an A19 Roundabout email address
 - Press Release
 - Internal Consultation with Council departments
 - External Consultation with interest groups and the Emergency services

8. The following responses were received:

Source	Number
Email	93
Clifton Library Display	4
9, St Leonards Place Display	3
Rawcliffe Bar P&R Display	4
Rawcliffe Bar Exhibition	4 (22 attendees)
Letters	7
Telephone Calls	4

9. The responses included over 270 comments with approximately 30 unique items. A more detailed list of comments and officer responses is included in Annex 3. The items in order of number of times raised are listed in the following table.

General Comment	Number Of Comments	Rank
Congestion in area is caused by A59 roundabout	26	1
Concerns about merging traffic on A1237	24	2
Concerns about driver behaviour on the roundabout	24	2
Supportive of scheme	23	4
Other sections of A1237 should be upgraded	18	5
Traffic signals would improve capacity/safety	18	5
The A1237 needs to be dual carriageway	16	7
Proposal not considered to be value for money	15	8
Segregated Left Turn Lane would improve capacity	14	9
Pedestrian/cycling issues	13	10
Concerns about congestion on the A19 Northbound out of City	12	11
Concerns about affect on landscaped embankment	11	12
Concerns that the scheme will not reduce journey times in the area	11	12
Concerns about closure of westbound Lay-by	10	14
Concerns about traffic speeds on roundabout	9	15
Concerns about queue lengths since previous upgrade	4	16
Concerns about level of lighting proposed	3	17
Questioned value of existing underpass & use by peds/cyclists	3	17
Concerns over access to Ings Cottages/House	3	17
Flyovers are needed	2	20
Concerns about access/ exit to Rawcliffe Bar P&R	2	20
Should spend money on alternative modes of transport	2	20
Problems exiting Manor Lane will be worse	2	20
Misc. Comments (Raised by single resident - 14 items)	14	24

Summary of Comments

10. The main comment areas are listed in the table above and summarised in the subsequent paragraphs. More detailed responses are included in Annex 3 and the changes proposed to the scheme to address the comments are identified in the design section of the report. The comments principally relate to suggestions that different improvements at the roundabout or alternative locations would provide better value for money solutions. Other comments highlight concerns about driver behaviour (speed and lane discipline), concerns about the proposed merge lanes, the consequences of the proposed closure of the westbound lay-by and the impact of the scheme on cyclists and pedestrians.
11. The council have undertaken a number of studies into the operation of the A1237 Outer Ring Road which has identified the highest priority junctions for improvement. The latest study was reported to the Executive on 23 September 2008. The studies have shown that for affordability, value for money and environmental impact reasons improving the existing roundabouts is considered to be the most appropriate way forward.
12. The busiest section of the A1237 is between the A19 and A59. It is not expected that the full benefit of the A19 upgrade will be realised until the improvements to the A59 roundabout, proposed to be funded through the Access York Phase 1 project, have been completed. However for eastbound A1237 and southbound A19 traffic the proposed A19 roundabout improvements are expected to substantially reduce journey times even in advance of the A59 upgrade.
13. The provision of segregated left turn lanes and traffic signalised solutions have been investigated but are not considered to be warranted, feasible or affordable at this location.
14. The twin lane straight ahead approaches and exits are a fundamental element of the scheme to achieve the desired increased capacity for the A1237. The layout is similar to the exit onto the A1237 recently constructed at the Hopgrove roundabout but provides a wider hatched central strip between the lanes rather than double white lines. Additional signing and lining will be provided to identify the new road layout. It is anticipated that the increased capacity at the roundabout will reduce the incentive for drivers to use the incorrect lane. It is considered that the traffic islands proposed on the 3 lane approaches will assist in reducing speeds and deter the use of incorrect lanes on the roundabout.
15. Closure of the A1237 westbound lay-by is essential to enable the safe operation of the merge lanes proposed on the exit to the roundabout. Following comments made during the consultation period it is now proposed to provide an alternative 24hr parking area in the Park & Ride extension car park to compensate for the loss of this facility.
16. A number of amendments are proposed to the scheme to address the safety and accessibility comments raised by local residents, cyclists and the police. It

is proposed to provide an at grade crossing facility of the A1237 East arm for cyclists and pedestrians which can be used when the subway is not available. The widened segregated footway/cycleway is planned to be extended to the riverside cycle route. An additional traffic island is proposed at the access to Ings Cottages.

17. More detail of the main comments in the list above with officer responses is included Annex 3.

Consultation with Outside Bodies

18. The consultation drawings were sent out to the standard list of stakeholders including the Emergency Services, Cycling Groups, North Yorkshire County Council, Skelton & Rawcliffe Parish Councils etc.
19. Comments were received back from North Yorkshire Police, North Yorkshire County Council, Rawcliffe Parish Council and the CTC as identified in the following paragraphs.

North Yorkshire Police

20. North Yorkshire Police have been involved with the independent Safety Audit process and have also commented on the proposed outline design. They raised a number of concerns including the need to address the consequences of removing the westbound lay-by, the lack of ground level pedestrian/cycling facility on the A1237 eastbound approach above the subway and the merging arrangements following the roundabout.
21. Constructive discussions have been held with a representative from the police and they are satisfied that, taking into account the layout constraints which apply to the scheme, the proposed revised design adequately addresses their concerns. The scheme will be subject to an independent safety audit later in the project programme which will include review by an independent police team.

North Yorkshire County Council

22. North Yorkshire County Council supports the proposed improvements to the A19 /A1237 roundabout. They consider that the improvements would improve journeys in / out of York /North Yorkshire and accessibility to key services for residents of both North Yorkshire and York, particularly through the use of the Park and Ride facilities at Rawcliffe Bar.
23. They have asked to be kept fully up to date with future plans and any traffic management issues etc throughout the construction and development of the scheme as they will possibly impact upon traffic flows etc within North Yorkshire.

Rawcliffe Parish Council

24. An Officer from the council attended the Rawcliffe Parish Council meeting on 14 December to enable the scheme to be discussed. Subsequently the Parish Council issued a formal response to the consultation which included the following comments:
25. The Parish Council are aware that consultation in 2000 proposed the view that any improvement work on A19/ A1237 would have little effect until extensive improvements were made to the A59 roundabout – and would therefore like to question the validity/effectiveness of proposed improvements with this view in mind? Would it not be prudent to defer any improvements to the A19/A1237 roundabout until A59 roundabout has been improved?
26. The loss of the lay-by by Rawcliffe Bar Park and Ride amounts to the loss of a well used public amenity and as such the Parish Council strongly objects to this proposal.
27. The Parish Council wish to propose that the possibility of a deceleration lane/slip road into Manor Lane is explored to reduce the congestion and assist the flow of traffic in this area.
28. The pedestrian refuge (on the west side) is not a safe access and pedestrians should be encouraged to use the underpass.
29. The Parish Council feels very strongly that segregated lanes divided by pedestrian refuge will cause confusion to drivers. Inclusion of such in this development should correspond with detailed monitoring of this section of the scheme.

Officer Response

30. It is anticipated that the A19 improvements will reduce journey times in the area – particularly in the eastbound and southbound directions prior to the upgrade of the A59. The full benefit of the A19 improvements is unlikely to be realised until the A59 roundabout is upgraded as well.
31. To enable the two lane exit to be provided on the A1237 it is not considered safe to maintain the westbound lay-by in position. In response to the comments made it is proposed to provide a 24 hr parking area in the Park & Ride extension car park.
32. Owing to the relatively slow speeds of traffic off the roundabout it is not considered necessary to provide a deceleration lane at the A19/Manor Lane junction location. There is a risk that it would be less safe for vehicles exiting Manor Lane if a deceleration lane was provided on the A19 due to the potential for reduced visibility of vehicles travelling southbound on the A19 behind left turning vehicles.
33. The safest crossing point of the A1237 for pedestrians/cyclists is considered to be the subway however this does not cater for all movements. It is therefore considered necessary to provide additional islands on the arms of the roundabout with 3 lane approaches. In addition if the subway is not available

for use safe crossing points need to be provided for cyclists/pedestrians who still need to gain access to York/Skelton.

34. The additional pedestrian crossing islands act as subsidiary deflection islands which are a standard method of reducing traffic speeds at roundabouts.

CTC North Yorkshire

35. The CTC have concerns about how the proposed scheme fits within an overall sustainable transport policy.
36. They identify that the consultation leaflet refers to reducing delays in the locality and improving safety for all road users. It is their view that safety of pedestrians and cyclists, irrespective of their amenity, will not be enhanced by the provision of more traffic lanes. They would like to be assured that this has been modelled or otherwise audited. They would also press for simultaneous safety enhancements to the dedicated cycle links across the bridges, at the very least a parallel cantilevered lightweight bridge of adequate width and of a standard to encourage significant increase of cycle use for the short journeys made between the various housing and employment locations.
37. They are convinced that there is significant potential for modal shift towards environmentally friendly modes on the route under consideration, but regret that Cycle City plans do not appear to have been directed towards the need for appropriate and radical measures. It is their view that the council should recognize that meaningful promotion of cycling can tackle congestion and its increased adoption will reduce the oil-dependence of our transport system and be good for our energy security and balance of trade. Economic benefits in another context would come from reduced health-care costs and absenteeism, with improved productivity. Thus the need to abandon this scheme in favour of other measures which could be less socially divisive, and particularly look more closely at individual travel needs/aspirations and target accordingly.

Officer Response

38. Improvements to the Outer Ring Road are included with the Council's Local Transport Plan which was prepared after widespread consultation with the residents of York. It is anticipated that increased capacity at the A19 will help to reduce traffic levels in residential areas of the city and enable the transfer of road space to more sustainable modes. The upgraded layout has been designed to accommodate cyclist/pedestrian movements wherever possible. No more than two lanes of traffic have to be crossed on all arms of the roundabout. Unfortunately improvements to the cycle route over the river Ouse are outside the scope of this project.
39. The promotion of cycling is a key element of the Local Transport Plan with the initial results of the Cycling City programme suggesting significant increase in the numbers of people cycling. The Council is delivering a significant programme of cycling infrastructure works across the city which is prioritised on a value for money basis to achieve higher cycling levels.

Member Views

40. Officers consulted with Skelton, Rawcliffe and Clifton Without Ward Councillors Waudby, Moore and Watt, plus Councillors D'Agorne, Gillies and Potter on the proposals. Their responses to the consultation layout are summarised below.

Ward Member Views

41. Councillor Watt has the following comments:
- Considers that the upgrade would be a waste of public money.
 - Does not approve of the removal of the Westbound Lay-by.
 - A major bottle-neck is caused by the island on the A19 at the end of Manor Lane - can this not be altered to permit 2 lanes Northbound?
 - Concerned about lane discipline on the roundabout
42. Councillor Waudby had the following comment on the option layout, no further comments have been received on the consultation layout:
- Concerned about the effect on the existing footpath/cycle path over the bridge, particularly in relation to the number of young people going from Rawcliffe to Manor School.
43. Councillor Moore had the following comments on the option layout, no further comments have been received on the consultation layout:
- Opposes the closure of the westbound layby
 - Raises concerns about the need for enforcement of traffic regulations at the roundabout
 - Raises the issue of the capacity of the A59 roundabout restricting flows in the A19 roundabout area.

Other Member Views

44. Councillor D'Agorne raised concerns about the provision of cycling and pedestrian facilities on the outline layout. No further comments have been received on the consultation layout.
45. Councillor Gillies had the following comments on the outline layout -- he has no further comments on the consultation layout:
- Concerned about the possible closure of the westbound layby
 - Raises concerns about traffic speeds and cyclists using the Skelton cycle route.
46. Councillor Potter had the following comments on the option layout -- she has no further comments on the consultation layout:
- Concerned about the possible closure of the westbound layby and suggests that an alternative parking area with access to the river bank should be provided if the layby is closed.

Response to Member Views

47. The majority of the comments have been addressed in the main part of the report and in Annex 3. Other items are addressed in the following paragraphs.
48. The traffic island close to the end of Manor Lane provides a dual function of a pedestrian/cycling crossing and protection to the right turn movement into Manor Lane. Alterations would require significant widening of the road into the south verge to allow the facility to be maintained. Further investigation has revealed the presence of services which would be prohibitively expensive to move.
49. Cycling movements over Ouse Bridge will continue to be possible from the A19 area throughout the construction works and in the permanent layout. It is proposed to continue the segregated path between the A19 and river Ouse embankment.
50. It is proposed to provide a CCTV camera at the roundabout to enable traffic movements in the area to be monitored and allow improved management of the network.
51. It is considered unlikely that signalling the roundabout would provide additional capacity unless the roundabout was substantially increased in size to allow the provision of storage capacity in the circulatory area.
52. The lane designations will be designed to minimise overall queuing however it may not be possible to allocate lanes to suit all conditions due to variations in the turning movements during different times of the day and week. Lane designations may be amended throughout the life of the roundabout to accommodate changes to the turning movements which may occur in future years.

Design

53. The proposed detailed design for the roundabout improvements has been prepared by the Council's framework consultant Halcrow to deliver an upgraded roundabout with additional capacity which is safe for all users. The layout has been amended since the option report to meet current design standards, address comments received during the consultation period and minimise the cost of service diversions. The proposed layout is shown in Annex 4.
54. The following main changes are proposed from the consultation layout:

General

55. It is proposed to include a CCTV camera at the roundabout to enable traffic movements to be monitored. The location is to be confirmed but the current preferred position is between the A19 North and A1237 East arms near the north end of the subway.

56. Destination lane markings (e.g. S'BRO, LEEDS etc.) have been changed on the approaches and circulatory carriageway to simplify and match those used elsewhere on the ring road.

A19 North Arm

57. An additional traffic and pedestrian island is proposed north of the access to Ings House/Cottages to restrict traffic to a single lane north of this point. This will make the turning movements in and out of the access safer to undertake.
58. It is proposed to move the start of the left turn lane southwards owing to the presence of a BT chamber and fibre optic cables in the southbound verge. The cost of moving the chamber was estimated by BT to be over £200k and would have significant impact on the project programme and the communication infrastructure in the area. Transport modelling has been undertaken which indicates that the changes will not have a significant affect on the capacity of this arm of the roundabout.
59. The pedestrian crossing position has been moved southwards and the length of the existing traffic island has been reduced to enable the 3 southbound lanes and traffic island to be accommodated.
60. The extent of the cycle/pedestrian route has been adjusted on the southbound approach to allow the eastbound A1237 to be joined by cyclists without rejoining the A19. The adjustment will also allow pedestrians to gain access to the ground level crossing point of the A1237 if the subway is not available.

A1237 East Arm

61. It is proposed to provide an additional traffic island on the A127 westbound approach to provide a safe at grade crossing position for the 3 lane approach. Consequential adjustments to the cycle and pedestrian routes are proposed which moves them to the east side of the subway.

A19 South Arm

62. Adjustments are proposed to the cycle/walking route to accommodate the additional A1237E traffic island.

Park & Ride Access

63. No changes.

A1237 West Arm

64. It is proposed to shorten the central island slightly to enable the approach lanes and cycle route to be accommodated within the highway boundary.
65. It is proposed to extend the widened segregated cycle/pedestrian route westwards to the access to the riverside at the start of the river bridge embankment. This will minimise conflict with pedestrians and cyclists on this route.

66. To compensate for the removal of the westbound lay-by facility it is proposed to provide a dedicated section of the Park & Ride extension car park which will be available for use 24hrs. The existing height barrier will be maintained in position and the remainder of the car park gated off for opening when the extension car park was needed for the Park & Ride operation. A route will be provide to enable walkers access to the A1237 footway and thence on to Rawcliffe Ings.

Site Clearance

67. To ensure that the scheme can be constructed in the summer/autumn, advance site clearance is required on the embankment on the south side of the A1237 east of the A19. To avoid the bird nesting season between March and October the site clearance must be undertaken in February or the work in the area may need to be delayed which would push the end date of the scheme into one of the busiest periods at the Park & Ride site (St. Nicholas Fayre onwards). The extent of the site clearance will be kept to a minimum to allow the works to be constructed. Replanting of the bund will be undertaken once the scheme is complete.

Programme

68. The aim of the project is to deliver the improvements by the end of 2010. The following milestones are envisaged.

Activity	Programme	Status
Outline Design	July - October 2009	Complete
Consultation	November - December 2009	Complete
Detailed Design	December 2009 - February 2010	Ongoing
Site Clearance (Embankment Vegetation)	February 2010	
Tender Process	March – June 2010	
Utility Diversions	April – July 2010	
Main Construction	July – November 2010	

69. It is anticipated that the majority of the works will be undertaken whilst maintaining all existing traffic lanes (speed restrictions and lane narrowing may be required) although some of the work, such as resurfacing, will need to be undertaken at night to minimize traffic disruption. This will be kept to a minimum to reduce the impact on local residents. For safety and cost reasons, where possible, the scheme has been designed to minimize the need to undertake major work in the centre of the carriageway.

Estimated Costs

70. The estimated construction cost for the revised proposed scheme is £1.280m including service diversions, design and supervision. The inclusion of an

allowance for contingencies means that it would be prudent to provide a budget allocation of £1.5m in the Capital Programme. The increase from the £1.4m estimate identified in the October report is principally due to the inclusion of a CCTV camera, additional traffic islands on the A19 and A1237 East, amendments to the A1237 West cycle route and provision of the dedicated parking area in the Park & Ride site.

Corporate Priorities

71. The improvements to the capacity of the A19 roundabout will contribute to the following corporate priorities:
72. Thriving City – Additional traffic capacity will reduce journey times in the area enabling trips to the adjacent business and retail areas to be undertaken more efficiently. The upgrading of the capacity of the Outer Ring Road is one of the key strategies within the council's Local Transport Plan.
73. Sustainable City – The improved capacity will contribute to enabling the delivery of developments on the brownfield sites in York Northwest.
74. Safer City – The projected reduction in traffic travelling along adjacent roads is anticipated to reduce the level of accident risk in residential areas.

Implications

75. The following implications have been reviewed.
 - **Financial** -- It is proposed to fund the £1.5m required for the construction of the A19 roundabout improvements from the 2009/10 and 2010/11 City Strategy Capital Programme. Details of the funding allocations for the entire 2010/11 programme will be submitted for approval to the Executive Member in March. Sufficient funds are available from the supplementary Regional Funding Allocation for the delivery of this scheme in 2010/11. Funds are available in the 2009/10 allocation to complete the design, prepare the tender documents and undertake the site clearance.
 - **Human Resources (HR)** – There are no Human Resource implications.
 - **Equalities** – There are no equalities implications
 - **Legal** – There are no legal implications
 - **Crime and Disorder** – There are no crime and disorder implications
 - **Information Technology (IT)** – There are no IT implications
 - **Property** – There are no property implications
 - **Other** – There are no other implications

Risk Management

76. A full risk register for the delivery of the project has been prepared and mitigation measures applied where necessary. In compliance with the

Council's risk management strategy measured in terms of impact and likelihood, the risk score has been assessed at less than 16. This means that at this point the risks need only to be monitored as they do not provide a real threat to the achievement of the objectives of this report.

Contact Details

Author:
Tony Clarke
Capital Programme Manager
City Strategy
Tel No. 55 1641

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:
Damon Copperthwaite
Assistant Director City Development and
Transport

Report Approved Date 22/01/2010

Chief Officer's name
Title

Report Approved *tick* Date *Insert Date*

Specialist Implications Officer(s)

Wards Affected: *Skelton, Clifton Without and Rawcliffe*

All

For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers

Executive Member for City Strategy Decision Session 21 July 2009: Regional Funding Allocation Proposal
Executive Member for City Strategy Decision Session 20 October 2009: Outline Design Report

Annexes

Annex 1: Consultation Leaflet
Annex 2: Consultation Drawing
Annex 3: Consultation Comments and Officer Responses.
Annex 4: Proposed Layout Drawing.